

Minutes
M-002-2022-IUGS-COGE

Date:	24th July 2022
Time:	18.30 hours (AWST)
Place/Type (chair):	Virtual (Zoom meeting, hosted by Sandra Villacorta)
Attendees:	Sandra Villacorta (SV) Greg McNamara (GM), Ian Clark (IC), Clara Vasconcelos (CV), Roberto greco (RG), Miguel Cano (MC), Shankar R (SR) and Yamina Bourgeoini (YB).
Apologies:	Gary Lewis (GL), Young-Shin Park (YP), Jesús Martínez (JM), and Maria Bravo (MB), Gerel Ochir (GO)

Item	Description		
1	Quorum: There being eight (08) commissioners present, a quorum was declared, and the meeting proceeded.		
2	Business arising from previous meetings		
	Resolution	Responsible	Status
	Opening a call for a COGE vice chair and other members of the COGE Board	SV/IC	Pending
	Draft the Chris King medal proposal and submit to the regular members for feedback	SV/IC	Pending
	Draft Proposal for the creation of a subcommission to oversee the Geoscience Education Field Officers (GEFO) Programme	SV	Pending
	Circulating the member nomination procedure to regular members for approval	SV	Completed
	Send to SV the previous reports and minutes	IC	Pending
	Updating website	GM	Pending
	Invite professionals from currently unrepresented countries to apply for COGE membership.	All	Ongoing
	Send more information about the next International Geological Congress	YP	Pending
3	Review of agenda subjects		
	Agenda subject	Action	Responsible
	New members' applications: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SV informed attendees that three applications for Regular Membership were received, and that a voting form had already been circulated to all current Regular Members for formal evaluation. It was noted that one of the applications is associated with a formal complaint concerning professional conduct. In light of the sensitivity of this case, IC and GM recommended that related discussions be addressed internally. In response to CV's inquiry about accessing the application forms, SV clarified that 	Review the application forms and associated documentation supporting each candidate	All
		Vote using the provided Google voting form to assess each candidate for Regular Membership.	All

<p>applications and supporting documents had been uploaded to the shared folder in the COGE's Google Drive account and are available for those members who want to consult the details of each case before casting their vote.</p>		
<p>Review of the Nomination Procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The draft procedure for nominating new Regular Members was reviewed. ● By consensus, attendees approved the set of questions in the voting form to formally endorse the proposed nomination procedure. ● RG noted the current lack of representation from sub-Saharan Africa. ● GM provided an overview of regional representation within COGE, reporting active members from the following regions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Australia: 1 ○ USA: 1 ○ South America: 3 ○ Europe: 2 ○ Asia: 4 ○ Africa: 1 ● IC pointed out that there are still inactive members who should be contacted to clarify their status. ● It was agreed by consensus that if any member fails to respond to a continuity inquiry within two weeks, their membership will be cancelled due to inactivity. ● SR highlighted the importance of enhancing geographical diversity and encouraging applicants from underrepresented regions. In support of this, SV referenced a recent email from MB emphasizing the need to include minorities in future membership callings. ● In response to questions about eligibility criteria, SV confirmed that all relevant details are outlined in the Nomination Procedure proposal, which remains accessible in the shared Google Drive folder for those members who did not review it. 	<p>Create and circulate a Development Survey to consult COGE members on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Ideal number of Regular and Associate Members <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended number of representatives per country <input type="checkbox"/> Confirmation of interest in continuing as a COGE member 	<p>IC</p>
	<p>To email inactive commissioners about their continuity in the commission. Note: If no response is received within two weeks, membership will be vacated.</p>	<p>IC</p>
	<p>Encourage identification and invitation of professionals from underrepresented countries to apply for COGE membership.</p>	<p>SV</p>
<p>Chris King Medal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● IC suggested that the approved proposal for the Chris King Medal should include a financial provision, specifically to support the winner's travel to attend the award presentation during an IGC special session. ● RG raised the question of whether Field Officers could be eligible for the medal and proposed considering an additional award aimed at early-career Earth scientists. 	<p>Prepare the budget covering medal costs, IGC/GeoSciEd participation, and estimated registration, accommodation, and travel expenses for medalists</p>	<p>IC</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attendees agreed that the medal recipient will also be invited to participate in the GEFO Programme training. CV emphasized the importance of recognizing senior geoscience educators who have devoted their careers to teaching and mentoring new generations of geoscientists. 		
	<p>Early Career Geoeducators funding proposed by IGEO officers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SV notified the attendees about a proposal submitted by IGEO female colleagues to establish a joint initiative with COGE to support early-career geoscientists. SR remarked that the proposal appeared to be informal and recommended that no further steps be taken until a formal one is issued by the incoming IGEO leadership. SV subsequently reported that the proposal had been internally dismissed by the incoming IGEO President, who described it in email correspondence as an “informal discussion among friends” and suggested it would be “misleading” to bring the matter forward within COGE. It was expressed concern that this characterization risked diminishing both the initiative and the professional contributions of the female IGEO colleagues involved. Attendees agreed that no further action would be taken until a formal statement is issued by IGEO leadership in the future. 	<p>Suspend further action on progressing the Early Career Geoeducators funding proposal until IGEO’s Executive Committee communicates it officially.</p>	<p>SV/IC</p>
		<p>To inform the IUGS Executive Committee to support transparency and foster respectful, inclusive collaboration with IGEO.</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>
	<p>Next Commission’s steps</p> <p>SV raised concerns about the lack of a formal operational framework within the Commission, including the absence of Terms of Reference, statutes, a code of conduct, and past reports on the website. She reiterated her request to IC and GM for access to previous governance documents.</p>	<p>Draft initial Terms of Reference (ToR) or statutes for COGE based on examples from other IUGS commissions and circulate among members to get feedback.</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>
<p>4</p>	<p>Post-Meeting Developments (July - December 2022)</p>		
	<p>Membership:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Of the three Regular Membership applications evaluated through a voting process, two applications were endorsed, while one could not be endorsed, due to an unresolved professional conduct complaint formally filed (August 2022). Although the process was handled under IUGS Bylaws, concerns were raised by two COGE members, who also serve within IGEO, questioning the procedure. Their objections, along with unauthorized 	<p>Introduce the new members integrated into the commission</p>	<p>Board</p>
		<p>Conduct a second voting round to confirm the decision regarding the observed membership application.</p>	<p>Board [Done]</p>

<p>disclosures of internal deliberations, prompted the launch of a second voting round to reaffirm transparency and due process.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A situational report was submitted by COGE Chair to the IUGS Executive, highlighting structural and procedural gaps, including the absence of consolidated governance documents and the need to institutionalize a more transparent and documented membership evaluation process. (August 2022) • The IUGS Executive Committee requested an ad hoc review of the relationship between COGE and IGEO, in light of concerns surrounding overlapping roles and shared members. (October 2022) • A second internal voting round was conducted. Outcome: Confirmed the August decision regarding the disputed membership application (November 2022). • The IUGS Executive Committee entrusted the Commission on Geoethics with conducting an independent review (November 2022). 	<p>Provide relevant information to the IUGS Executive and the members of the Geoethics Commission about the observed membership case.</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>
	<p>Inform members about the formal outcome of the IUGS Adhoc review.</p>	<p>SV</p>
	<p>Submit a situational report to IUGS outlining operational challenges and internal developments, including the membership case.</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>
<p>Progress on other COGE activities:</p> <p><i>GEFO Programme Coordination</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efforts to advance the implementation of the GEFO Programme continued in collaboration with EGU Education. A coordination meeting is planned to define next steps. <p><i>Governance Structure Implementation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed Terms of Reference (ToR) underwent several rounds of internal consultation through surveys. They were formally approved by voting members in December 2022 and define the Commission's structure, roles, and procedures. • As outlined in the approved ToR, COGE initiated the formal structuring of its governance through the creation of the following committees: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Finance ○ Social Media ○ International Relations ○ GEFO Programme ○ Publications <p><i>Annual Work Plan and Budget Proposal</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The COGE Board was tasked with finalizing the 2022 Report and preparing the 2023 Annual Work Plan and Budget. This will be presented by SV during the IUGS Executive Committee meeting in Belfast, scheduled for February 2023. <p><i>Web Presence and Visibility</i></p>	<p>Set up a meeting with EGU education leaders.</p>	<p>SV/IC [Done]</p>
	<p>Conduct internal evaluations and revisions of COGE's Terms of Reference proposal</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>
	<p>Conduct a SWOT analysis to assess the Commission's strategic positioning and needs.</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>
	<p>Update the COGE Facebook page and create other social media accounts for the commission to raise visibility</p>	<p>SV</p>
	<p>Submit ToR to IUGS EC for formal approval</p>	<p>SV</p>
	<p>Prepare the 2022 Annual Report and 2023 Working Plan draft and submit to members for feedback</p>	<p>SV [Done]</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Following the resignation of the former webmaster (GM) and Facebook page coordinator, SV temporarily assumed communication responsibilities. A call was launched to recruit a new webmaster. In parallel, the SWOT analysis conducted by SV, with input from several members, identified the need to improve visibility and outreach. As a result, the creation of new social media channels was recommended and is underway. 		
5	Next meeting: to be organized by SV		
	Time	TBA	
	Date	TBA	
	Place/Type	Virtual (Zoom meeting hosted by SV)	
6	Meeting closure: 19:40 hours (AWS)		

Minute taker:	SV
---------------	----

Review:	Minutes of the 24th of July meeting accepted
Date:	31-07-2022
Update (04-06-2025)	The Governance and Membership Committee of IUGS–COGE reviewed and updated this document to ensure accuracy, transparency, and integrity of institutional records on decisions and follow-up actions based on a review of official correspondence and governance records for the period during which this minutes were written.